The Death of the Songwriter: attribution of creative ownership in popular music production

Joe Bennett
Bath Spa University
joebennett.net
@joebennettbath

Whose creativity?

Example 1 (1999)

Example 2 (1967)
Example 3 (1998)

Example 4 (1938)

Anti-romantic creativity

New
Surprising
Valuable

The creative mind: myths and mechanisms (Boden, 2004)
The Systems Model of Creativity (Csikszentmihalyi, 1988)

Research questions

How do collaborators allocate creative duties?
How do they attribute copyright ownership?
What musical activities generate IP? Why?
How do we value or reward different creative contributions?
Influence, genre and plagiarism – ‘linear collaboration’?
Creative attribution

- Is an economic right
- Is a moral right
- Is the mechanism by which songwriters get paid

Song vs Track

A musical work:
"a work consisting of music, exclusive of any words or action intended to be sung, spoken or performed with the music."

A literary work:
"any work, other than a dramatic or musical work, which is written, spoken or sung"

A sound recording:
"a recording of the whole or any part of a literary, dramatic or musical work, from which sounds reproducing the work or part may be produced."

(UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988)

Creative contributions

Performance/Song/Track paradigm from Moore (2012)

Taxonomies of songwriting process

Primary research:
- interviews and co-writes with pro songwriting teams 2009-2013

Additional sources (songwriter interviews)
- Process-based
- Time-based
- Production-based
Process taxonomy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process name</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lyric-setting</td>
<td>Lyric is provided to composer, who writes melody in response, sometimes with edits.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music-setting</td>
<td>Melody is provided to lyricist, who writes lyric in response.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title-first iterative</td>
<td>Title pre-agreed; music and lyrics developed iteratively and interdependently.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melody-first iterative</td>
<td>A melodic fragment, usually in harmonic context, is provided and music &amp; lyric are developed interdependently.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmony-first iterative</td>
<td>A chord sequence is established and melody and lyric are developed interdependently.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Band iterative</td>
<td>A live band plays stimulus fragments generated by its members and evaluates them for inclusion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toplining</td>
<td>A backing track is created; a collaborator then provides melody and/or lyrics. Often includes post-production editing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Time-based taxonomy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Collaboration timescale</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Simultaneous present</td>
<td>Collaborators collaborate face to face in real time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iterative present</td>
<td>Collaborators work face to face but on different tasks, demarcated by skillset.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simultaneous absent</td>
<td>Collaborators work simultaneously online, for example on a shared lyric document, or over video link.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iterative absent</td>
<td>Collaborators pass the song back and forth, adding to and adapting the Other's contribution. Common in online collaborations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linear absent</td>
<td>Collaborators pass the song back and forth, adding to but not adapting the Other's contribution. Common in music/lyric demarcated teams.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Production taxonomy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creative model</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subtracted production</td>
<td>The song is fixed in a tangible medium (performed audio demo or notation), ready for recording at a later date.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated production</td>
<td>Songwriting and recording occur simultaneously or overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-integrated production</td>
<td>Some audio remnants of the songwriting process survive in the final recording but others are later replaced.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The issues

Collaborators may generate song and track simultaneously

Listeners do not differentiate

Separating creative contributions is difficult in real-time, and impossible retrospectively

Different creative activities enjoy different levels of copyright protection

Is 'influence' merely linear historical collaboration?
Whose creativity?

Concerto for Violin in F Major, Op. 8, No. 3, RV293, Autumn, I. Allegro
Capella Istropolitana

(You Make Me Feel Like) A Natural Woman
Aretha Franklin

No Matter What
Boyzone

It Don’t Mean a Thing (If It Ain’t Got That Swing)
Stephane Grappelli and Django Reinhardt
(Quintette du Hot Club de France)

Assumptions?

Concerto for Violin in F Major, Op. 8, No. 3, RV293, Autumn, I. Allegro
Antonio Vivaldi (composer)

(You Make Me Feel Like) A Natural Woman
Aretha Franklin (vocalist)

No Matter What
Boyzone (boy band/vocalists)

It Don’t Mean a Thing (If It Ain’t Got That Swing)
Stephane Grappelli and Django Reinhardt (soloists)

Whose creativity?

Concerto for Violin in F Major, Op. 8, No. 3, RV293, Autumn, I. Allegro
Antonio Vivaldi

(You Make Me Feel Like) A Natural Woman
Gerry Goffin, Carole King, Jerry Wexler

No Matter What
Andrew Lloyd Webber and Jim Steinman

It Don’t Mean a Thing
(If It Ain’t Got That Swing)
Duke Ellington and Irving Mills

A recording that moves people is never just about the artist and the songwriters. It’s about people like:

[record company bosses] Jerry [Wexler] and Ahmet [Ertegun], who matched the songwriters with a great title and a gifted artist;

Arif Mardin, whose magnificent orchestral arrangement deserves the place it will forever occupy in popular music history;

…Tom Dowd, whose engineering skills capture the moment for posterity;

…the rhythm section, the orchestral players, and the singers.

…the promotion and marketing people that helped this song to reach more people than it might have without them.

But in the end it was Aretha’s performance that sent our song not only to the top of the charts but all the way to heaven.

(Carole King, 2012)
Case studies

Mona Lisa (1949)
Irreplaceable (2007)

Mona Lisa (1949)

Jay Livingston & Ray Evans

Commissioned by Paramount Pictures for the film ‘OSS’
(later ‘After Midnight/ Captain Carey USA’)

Original ‘Mona Lisa’ lyric changed to ‘After Midnight’ and back again.

(full story at joebennett.net/tag/mona-lisa)

Brief and veto as collaboration?

We had to write an Italian song. It was a picture called OSS, which was the CIA during World War II. Alan Ladd was in a little Italian town, and they wanted some way of warning him that the Nazis were coming with a patrol. He was there with a little radio and the partisans, and they [the film company] said, ‘Why doesn’t somebody play a song on an accordion, a street guy.’ He was blind but he could really see, and he’d start playing this song and that would warn Alan Ladd.

I started to write something kind of scary, but we thought ‘no, that’s going to warn the Germans.’ So we wrote ‘Mona Lisa.’

…[the film studio] said that [the Mona Lisa melody] sounded Italian and they liked it.


Initial idea is derivative

Ray had the title ‘Primadonna’. There was a big song called Ballerina out. You shouldn’t do it, but you do imitate…

I was driving in the car, and I went ‘Primadonna, Primadonna, de da de da’. I wrote the whole melody [in the car that day].

Of course, we didn’t like ‘Primadonna’ as a song. He [Evans] came up with the title ‘Mona Lisa’ the next day

(Livingston, in Carter 1990)
Commercial intervention

They [Paramount] loved title songs because it sold their picture. They changed the title of the picture OSS to After Midnight. They said, ‘We need a title song. Throw the lyric to Mona Lisa away and write After Midnight, because that’s a pretty melody and it sounds Italian.’ So we wrote, ‘I’m so lonely / and it’s only / after midnight / Did we leave the / candlelight, the / wine too soon.’ Same melody.

(Livingston, in Carter 1990)

Rewrite - After Midnight (1949)

Introduction
Soft guitars were playing as we whispered our goodnight
And the gondolier caressed his song
Love is on the way I know it’s just about in sight
May it soon come along

Theme (sung to the ‘Mona Lisa’ melody)
I’m so lonely, though it’s only after midnight
I’m so tattered by the soft Italian moon
Did we leave the candlelight, the wine too soon?
Do you lie awake as I’m awake this midnight?
Does the tick-tock of the clock seem much too slow?

In the hush of each long lonely hour
How I miss you, long to kiss you
But I know love will grow, love will flower
And then we’ll share this after midnight afterglow

Who really created Mona Lisa?

Sidney Keith Russell and Carl Sigman (Ballerina 1947) - four-syllable word became ‘Primadonna’

Paramount Pictures (an Italian melody - with veto)

Livingston and Evans (topline, lyric and harmony)

Nat King Cole (rhythmic interpretation, performance)

Leonardo Da Vinci (‘enigmatic’ inspiration)?
(or sitter Lisa Gherardini?)
**Irreplaceable (2007)**

Written in the studio by ‘Stargate’ (Tor Erik Hermansen & Mikkel Storleer Eriksen) and...

Ne-Yo aka Shaffer Smith (topline + lyric)...

+ ‘Espionage’: Espen Lind and Amund Bjørklund (guitar chords)

Beyoncé (vocalist) later credited as co-writer

“We put a lot of instrumental melodies in our music that singers and lyricists can use and adapt. Our goal is to inspire singers to come up with melodies, and then we edit these melodies and lyrics.” (Hermansen, in Tingen 2010)

---

**Ne-Yo & Beyoncé**

“I give other people credit where credit is due, like Beyonce really did vocally arrange [Irreplaceable].”

(Ne-Yo, in Moody 2007)

---

**Publishing royalties**

| Creators | KNOWLES, BEYONCE GISSELLE |
| Composer | ERIKSEN, MIKkel STORLEER |
| Composer/Author | HERMANNSEN, TOR ERIK |
| Composer | LINN, ESPEN |
| Composer | BJÖRKLUND, AMUND IVARSSON |
| Composer/Author | SMITH, SHAFFER |

**Publishers**

EMI MUSIC PUBLISHING LTD
SONY/ATV MUSIC PUBLISHING (UK) LIMITED
IMAGEM MUSIC

[percentages redacted]

---

**Attribution in Irreplaceable**

Production artefacts (guitar loop) credited

Producers credited

Topliner credited

Vocalist credited

A new and better model? Or a performer wielding economic power?
Questions

Are Cole or Paramount co-writers of Mona Lisa?

Should Beyoncé’s economic power beget a song credit?

What do we mean by ‘creating music’? Both words are contextually defined.

How do we protect arrangement-based or ‘non-melodic’ creative works? (e.g. Techno)?

Performers as creator?

Performers may or may not be credited as writers (e.g. Larry Mullen Jr / Ringo Starr)

UK case law for instrumentalists:

Hadley vs Kemp (sax solo is not part of the song)

Beckingam vs Hodgens (violinist is a songwriter)
(Bently 2009)

Beyoncé added to Irreplaceable credits 2007

Issues

Some songs are written in the studio

Contemporary songwriting often starts with the production

Vocalists add value (do they add creativity?)

Different admin mechanisms for different creative activities:

“I was paid £9 for the session. I’ve spent it since then.”
(Vic Flick, guitarist on the James Bond theme)

Is all art collaborative?

“We have come to take for granted ... the vital and enduring concept of originality. It carries with it an idea of the new, of something created in a godlike fashion out of nothing.

“[But] the antithetical notion of artistic creation... is that no one escapes history. Techniques and conventions developed by predecessors [...] are available as ready-made tools and have a profound effect. Above all, art is a conversation conducted down through the generations.”

(English novelist Ian McEwan, 2012)
References


